Comparing Cell Phone and Web for a Student Survey

Young-Je Woo Sun-Woong Kim Mick P. Couper

Dongguk University & University of Michigan

Outline

- * Background
- * Description of Dongguk University Time Use Survey
- * Study Design
- * Results
- * Conclusions

Background

- In many countries the proportion of the population with cell phones is higher than that with Internet access
- For this reason, recent attention has focused on surveys of cell phone users as well as Internet users
- However, there has been a lack of studies comparing cell phone surveys with Web surveys
- Thus, it is useful to compare these two modes of data collection in high-coverage populations

Description of Dongguk University Time Use Survey

- Sponsor: Dongguk University, South Korea
- Collector: Survey Research Center, Dongguk University
- Purpose: To guide policy by investigating students' time use at home or school, and how this relates to their curriculum and classes
- Year Started: 2005
- Frequency: Conducted annually
- Target Population: Undergraduate students registered in the second semester
- Sampling Frame: A list of registered students

Survey Questions

- Total number of questions: 48
- Categories
 - Student Information: Gender, grade, and age
 - School Life: Double major or minor, GPA, average hours for study per day, average hours of homework per day, secondary school certification program and graduate school
 - Personal Life: Type of residence, travel time to school, hours of sleep per night, average reading per month, expenditures, part-time jobs and club activities
 - Foreign Language: Attending private institutes for learning foreign languages, language studies abroad, foreign languages studied abroad and average study time for foreign languages.
 - Satisfaction: Satisfaction with school, major, offered courses, consultation and courses taught in English
 - > Others: Smoking, height and weight

Study Design

Sampling, Contacts and Follow-up

	Cell Phone Survey	Web Survey
Modes	CATI	Web-based survey via email
Sampling method	SRS (stratifie	ed by colleges)
Sample size	500	500
Dongguk University Website (Posting a notice)	Y	es
Prenotice email (First contact) & Prenotice text message (SMS) via cell phone (First contact)	Y	es

Study Design(continued)

	Cell Phone Survey	Web Survey
Cover letter (email) with questionnaire & SMS	No	Yes
First follow-up email & SMS (After the first week)	No	Yes
Second follow-up email & SMS (After the second week)	No	Yes
Calls by interviewers	At least 6	No
Incentive	No	No

Survey Schedule

	Cell Phone Survey	Web Survey
Survey Period	2010.11.09 ~ 11.26 (18 days)	2010.11.09 ~ 12.05 (27 days)
Prenotice email & SMS	2010	.11.09
Cover letter (email) with questionnaire & SMS	NO	2010.11.10
First follow-up email with questionnaire & SMS	NO	2010.11.18
Second follow-up email with questionnaire & SMS	NO	2010.11.29

Survey Costs

- Survey Research Center at Dongguk University has its own CATI facility, while it does not have general infrastructure for Web surveys
- Thus, it is difficult to discuss the exact costs between the two modes
- But the Cell/Web ratio of the overall cost per interview was about 1.5

Results

Sampling and Contact Procedures

Response Rate (RR), Cooperation Rate (COOP) and Refusal Rate (REF)

	Cell Phone Survey	Web Survey
Complete Interview (I)	403	108
Refusal and break off (R)	56	368
Noncontact (NC)	16	14
Partial Interview (P)	25	24
RR5	0.81	0.21
RR6	0.86	0.26
COOP3	0.83	0.22
COOP4	0.88	0.26
REF3	0.11	0.72

Complete Interview: Interview without item nonresponse

Refusal: Refusal in cell phone or no answer in emails

Noncontact: Cell phone number not in service or not picking up the cell phone or

dormant emails or email addresses with fatal errors

Partial Interview: Interview with at least one item nonresponse

Completed Interviews and Margin of Error

	Cell Phone Survey	Web Survey
Number of Completed Interviews	428	132
Margin of Error (Fully or Somewhat Satisfied with Major)	± 4.0%	± 8.2%
Margin of Error (Part-Time Jobs)	± 4.7%	± 7.1%

Population and Sample Distributions

Stratum	Population	Cell Phone Survey (Diff)	Web Survey (Diff)
1	18.2	20.1(1.9)*	22.0(3.8)
2	16.8	15.7(1.1)*	18.2(1.4)
3	13.1	14.9(1.8)	14.4(1.3)*
4	10.5	11.7(1.2)	9.8(0.7)*
5	8.5	7.2(1.3)*	4.5(4.0)
6	6.5	5.8(0.7)*	3.8(2.7)
7	6.0	6.8(0.8) *	7.6(1.6)
8	4.5	3.7(0.8)*	3.0(1.5)
9	4.3	3.5(0.8)*	3.0(1.3)
10	4.3	4.9(0.6)*	5.3(1.0)
11	2.7	2.6(0.1)*	5.3(2.6)
12	1.9	1.2(0.7)	1.5(0.4)*
13	1.8	1.4(0.4)*	0.8(1.0)
14	0.9	0.5(0.4)	0.8(0.1)*
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0

Strata (colleges)

Note: 1. Diff - Absolute value of difference between population and samples

2. * - The smaller difference

Population and Sample Distributions (continued)

Gender

	Population	Cell (Diff)	Web (Diff)
Male	55.1	51.6(3.5)	54.5(0.6)*
Female	44.9	48.4(3.5)	45.5(0.6)*
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0

* - The smaller difference

Grade

p	Population	Cell (Diff)	Web (Diff)
Freshman	22.5	20.7(1.8)*	26.4(3.9)
Sophomore	23.2	27.2(4.0)*	29.5(6.3)
Junior	26.1	25.0(1.1)*	21.7(4.4)
Senior	28.2	27.1(1.1)*	22.4(5.8)
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0

* - The smaller difference

Comparison of Responses between Cell Phone and Web Survey

Summary on Statistical Differences using 95% Confidence Intervals (CI)

	Number of Questions	Percent
Not Significant	21	58.3
(Partially) Significant	15	41.7
Total	36	100.0

Note: 'Partially' means 'At least one response item'

Selected Examples

Average Reading per Month (not for academic study)

	C 11		95%	CI
	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Almost do not read**	20.6	36.9	-25.394	-7.206
1	26.0	28.3	-11.464	6.864
2**	26.3	15.6	2.995	18.405
3	10.1	8.2	-3.607	7.407
4	6.1	6.8	-5.880	4.480
5**	4.9	1.3	0.812	6.388
6 or more	6.0	2.9	-0.982	7.182
Total	100.0	100.0		

Note: ** - The difference is significant

Average Hours for Homework per Day

- 0		L V		
	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Almost do not study**	11.4	3.2	3.658	12.742
1	37.7	31.1	-2.075	15.275
2	26.0	28.5	-10.645	5.645
3**	12.4	21.9	-17.484	-1.516
4	6.6	5.1	-3.405	6.405
5 or more	5.9	10.2	-10.615	2.015
Total	100.0	100.0		

Note: ** - The difference is significant

	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Almost do not assign**	41.1	52.0	-21.096	-0.704
1	35.9	27.5	-0.757	17.557
2	14.3	12.0	-4.235	8.835
3	5.5	6.8	-6.690	4.090
4	1.3	0.4	N/ 2	4
5 or over	1.9	1.3	-1.645	2.845
Total	100.0	100.0		

Average Hours for Foreign Languages

Satisfaction with School

Cell	Web	LL	UL
12.3	5.1	2.521	11.879
49.7	47.0	-7.286	12.686
34.6	34.6	-9.783	9.783
2.4	13.3	-17.156	-4.644
0.9	0.0	N	/A
100.0	100.0		
	12.3 49.7 34.6 2.4 0.9	12.3 5.1 49.7 47.0 34.6 34.6 2.4 13.3 0.9 0.0	12.3 5.1 2.521 49.7 47.0 -7.286 34.6 34.6 -9.783 2.4 13.3 -17.156 0.9 0.0 N/

Satisfaction with Major (or department or program)

Cell	Web	LL	UL
30.1	18.6	3.659	19.341
41.3	49.1	-17.646	2.046
21.5	23.6	-10.386	6.186
5.5	5.9	-4.984	4.184
1.6	2.8	-4.758	2.358
100.0	100.0		
	30.1 41.3 21.5 5.5 1.6	30.1 18.6 41.3 49.1 21.5 23.6 5.5 5.9 1.6 2.8	30.1 18.6 3.659 41.3 49.1 -17.646 21.5 23.6 -10.386 5.5 5.9 -4.984 1.6 2.8 -4.758

Major Courses One Wants to Take

	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Don not take any major courses	7.6	4.0	-0.378	7.578
Mostly offered**	48.2	29.6	9.791	27.409
Moderately offered**	35.2	48.5	-22.963	-3.637
Mostly not offered**	9.0	17.9	-15.799	-2.001
Total	100.0	100.0		

Survey Courses One Wants to Take

Cell	Web	LL	UL
22.1	8.8	6.643	19.957
29.2	24.7	-3.860	12.860
38.3	47.6	-19.299	0.699
10.4	18.9	-16.363	-0.637
100.0	100.0		
	22.1 29.2 38.3 10.4	22.1 8.8 29.2 24.7 38.3 47.6 10.4 18.9	22.1 8.8 6.643 29.2 24.7 -3.860 38.3 47.6 -19.299 10.4 18.9 -16.363

Opinion on Major Courses Taught in English

	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Extremely desirable	9.7	5.6	-0.624	8.824
Somewhat desirable**	28.2	13.8	7.225	21.575
Moderately desirable	26.8	31.4	-13.343	4.143
Somewhat undesirable**	22.1	32.8	-20.179	-1.221
Not at all desirable	13.2	16.4	-10.665	4.265
Total	100.0	100.0		

Opinion on Survey Courses Taught in English

1 million and the	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Extremely desirable	8.2	7.5	-4.644	6.044
Somewhat desirable**	31.4	20.7	3.015	18.385
Moderately desirable	30.3	32.3	-11.905	7.905
Somewhat undesirable**	19.1	29.5	-19.659	-1.141
Not at all desirable	11.0	10.0	-5.286	7.286
Total	100.0	100.0		

Taking a Course Taught in English

	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Yes	65.0	63.0	-6.985	10.985
No	35.0	37.0	-10.985	6.985
Total	100.0	100.0		

• Satisfaction with Courses Taught in English

and and a	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Fully satisfy	11.2	7.2	-2.535	10.535
Somewhat satisfy	39.5	37.8	-9.103	12.503
Moderately satisfy	31.5	27.9	-7.038	14.238
Somewhat dissatisfy**	10.9	22.5	-20.264	-2.936
Thoroughly dissatisfy	6.9	4.6	-3.044	7.644
Total	100.0	100.0		

Smoking	5			
	Cell	Web	LL	UL
Yes**	20.4	11.7	1.479	15.921
No**	79.6	88.3	-15.921	-1.479
Total	100.0	100.0		

Measurement Error

Secondary School Certification Program

	Cell		We	eb
	Frequency	Percentage	Frequency	Percent
TRUE	424	99.1***	130	98.5
FALSE	4	0.9	2	1.5
Total	428	100.0	132	100.0

*** - The higher proportion between the two modes

Double Major or Minor

	Cell		We	eb
	Frequency	Percent	Frequency	Percent
TRUE	408	95.3	127	97.7***
FALSE	20	4.7	3	2.3
Total	428	100.0	130	100.0

*** - The higher proportion between the two modes

GPA (to 2 decimal places)

	Cell		We	eb
	Frequency	Percent	Frequency	Percent
TRUE	75	18.2	64	54.2***
FALSE	337	81.8	54	45.8
Total	412	100.0	118	100.0

GPA (to 1 decimal place)

	Cell		Web	
	Frequency	Percent	Frequency	Percent
TRUE	187	45.4	91	77.1***
FALSE	225	54.6	27	22.9
Total	412	100.0	118	100.0

GPA (without decimal)

	Cell		Web	
	Frequency	Percent	Frequency	Percent
TRUE	346	84.0	117	99.2***
FALSE	66	16.0	1	0.8
Total	412	100.0	118	100.0

Item Nonresponse

Open-Ended Questions

Demons Item	No. of Item Nonresponse		
Response Item	Cell	Web	
GPA	11(2.6%)	11(8.3%)***	
Height	3(0.7%)	3(2.3%)***	
Weight	17(4.0%)	6(4.5%)***	

*** - The higher proportion between the two modes

Closed-Ended Questions

There was no missing data in the Cell group, while there were 17 items missed in the Web group

Conclusions

• The Cell phone survey has a distinct advantage over the Web survey with respect to response rates and coverage of domains

The Cell phone survey has lower item nonresponse than Web survey.
Particularly, for closed-ended questions, the Cell phone survey did not have any item nonresponse

 Significant differences between the two modes were found for about half the survey questions

•The Cell/Web ratio of the overall cost per interview was about 1.5

• Cell phone surveys may be useful to surveys in populations with universal or near-universal coverage, and where cell use may be more popular than internet use